

**MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF THE COUNCIL
HELD ON THURSDAY, 19 JULY 2018**

COUNCILLORS

PRESENT Saray Karakus (Mayor), Kate Anolue (Deputy Mayor), Huseyin Akpinar, Mahmut Aksanoglu, Maria Alexandrou, Daniel Anderson, Guner Aydin, Ian Barnes, Dinah Barry, Mahym Bedekova, Chris Bond, Sinan Boztas, Yasemin Brett, Anne Brown, Alev Cazimoglu, Nesil Caliskan, Mustafa Cetinkaya, Katherine Chibah, Will Coleshill, Jon Daniels, Lee David-Sanders, Birsen Demirel, Chris Dey, Guney Dogan, Elif Erbil, Ergin Erbil, Achilleas Georgiou, Alessandro Georgiou, Christine Hamilton, Ahmet Hasan, Elaine Hayward, Stephanos Ioannou, Rick Jewell, Nneka Keazor, Joanne Laban, Bernadette Lappage, Dino Lemonides, Tim Leaver, Derek Levy, Mary Maguire, Andy Milne, Gina Needs, Ahmet Oykener, Sabri Ozaydin, Vicki Pite, Lindsay Rawlings, Michael Rye OBE, George Savva MBE, Edward Smith, Jim Steven, Doug Taylor, Mahtab Uddin, Glynis Vince and Hass Yusuf

ABSENT Tolga Aramaz, Clare De Silva, Susan Erbil, Ergun Eren, Margaret Greer, Charith Gunawardena, Terence Neville OBE JP, Ayfer Orhan and Claire Stewart

**1
ELECTION IF REQUIRED OF THE CHAIR/DEPUTY CHAIR OF THE
MEETING**

Not required.

**2
THE MAYOR'S CHAPLAIN TO GIVE A BLESSING**

The Mayor's Chaplain, Reverend Martin Legg gave the blessing.

**3
MAYOR'S ANNOUNCEMENTS IN CONNECTION WITH THE ORDINARY
BUSINESS OF THE COUNCIL**

The Mayor welcomed everyone to her first ordinary meeting, since becoming Mayor of Enfield. She began by saying that she had embraced her mayoral duties with great pride.

1. Citizenship Ceremonies

One of the Mayor's first tasks had been to chair a citizenship ceremony. She had been honoured to play a part, together with so many of the people of the borough, taking their place in the country. Everyone was very excited and she had enjoyed being with them. She had attended six ceremonies so far.

2. Invitations and Thanks

The Mayor said that she had had many invitations over the last two months and would like to thank the Deputy Mayor, Councillor Kate Anolue, for helping her with some of the events. She felt that together with the Mayoral office they made a great team.

3. People

The Mayor had met many people involved in the Mayor's Office including Ann Cable (Deputy Lieutenant), Kathy Worrall, Paul Everitt, Shaun Rogan, Andrea Clemons, Catherine Drake, Michael Lerpiniere and the very helpful press team. She said that she had also received very many visitors from local organisations, many bringing flowers to the parlour.

4. Mayor's Charities

The Mayor said that she had been extremely lucky to meet so many representatives from the voluntary sector and community agencies and had been overwhelmed by the amount of work that they did for the borough's communities. From amongst these charities, she had chosen to support the following:

- Enfield Voluntary Action (supporting different communities and bringing them together)
- Mind in Enfield and Enfield Club House (helping those with mental health issues and supporting sufferers back into mainstream society)
- Platinum Dance School for Performing Arts (inspiring young people to achieve their full potential).
- Age UK Enfield (supporting the elderly)
- Face Front Inclusive Theatre (disabled and non-disabled arts practitioners how make multi layered theatre accessible to all)
- One to One Enfield (helping people with learning difficulties to have better lives)
- The Children's Society (fighting child abuse, making sure that no child feels alone)
- Noah's Ark Children's Hospice (supporting children with limited lives, and their families)
- Edmonton Eagles Boxing Club (positive mentoring for our youth)
- MacMillan Cancer Support
- The Reading Agency and the Book Trust (inspiring people of all ages and all backgrounds to read for pleasure and empowerment because education transforms lives)
- Enfield Volunteer Police Cadets (Mayor's Officer for Policing and Crime (MOPAC)) – encouraging youths to stay off the streets and give them a place to go, guiding them to a healthy lifestyle
- Over 50's Forum (providing support and combatting loneliness in Enfield)

The launch of the Mayor's Charity on 22 June 2018 had been a wonderful event, enjoyed by many people, with many different roles, from different backgrounds and communities. It had been an inclusive social gathering and the Mayor said that she had been overwhelmed by the amount of support that she had received. Over 400 people had attended.

Engagements

The Mayor had visited many local organisations, since becoming Mayor, and been amazed at the work being done in the borough, including the following:

- The Enfield Club House
- Enfield Asian Welfare Association
- Mevlana Mosque
- Revival Christian Church of Enfield
- Ingleborough Residents Association
- Saint Monica's Players' Spamalot at Millfield Theatre
- Women in Business
- Capel Manor
- Turkish Cypriot Festival
- Starksfield Primary School
- St John's Church Flower Show
- Enfield Choral Society Concert
- The Great Voluntary Sector Get together at Forty Hall
- PEP Parent Champion Graduation Ceremony
- Kingsmead School
- Butterflies Upcycling Festival
- Armed Forces Day
- Grand Final of Speak Out Challenge
- Bishops Stopford's 50th Jubilee Founders Day Celebrations
- 100 Hours of Volunteering
- Nightingale Erasmus Gala
- Ellenborough Tennis Club Competition
- Production of Lamah Hee at the Millfield Theatre
- Ponders End Together Summer Festival
- World Premier of London Town @ Palmers Green United Reformed Church
- Southgate Homebound and Disabled Association
- Capel Manor College Students Awards Ceremony
- Masquerade Ball at Forty Hall
- Wellbeing Connect Services Secondary Mental Health Debate
- The Space Between Us at the Chickenshed Theatre
- Celebration of Refurbishment at Quaker House
- Tamil Chariot Festival at Hindu Temple
- Independence Awards 2018 at Meridian Campus
- PAARs (Parent Abuse and Reconciliation Service) and Edmonton Rotary Club

COUNCIL - 19.7.2018

- Received the Deputy Mayor of Courbevoie in France – the twinning experience is progressing well.
- Held a mock debate with a Chinese English Language delegation in the Council Chamber

4

MINUTES OF THE MEETING HELD ON 23 MAY 2018

The minutes of the meeting held on 23 May 2018 were agreed as a correct record.

5

APOLOGIES

Apologies for absence were received from Councillors Aramaz, De Silva, Susan Erbil, Eren Ergun, Greer, Neville, Orhan, Stewart, and for lateness from Councillor Lappage.

6

DECLARATION OF INTERESTS

Jeremy Chambers, Director of Law and Governance, advised members that they would need to declare a non-pecuniary interest in relation to Motion 11.2 if they worked or had close connections to people who worked in the national Health Service.

Councillors Elif Erbil, Guney Dogan, Mary Maguire, Anne Brown, Ahmet Oykenner, Ergin Erbil, Alev Cazimoglu, Hass Yusuf, Nesil Caliskan and Alexandro Georgiou declared non-pecuniary interests in Motion 11.2 in the name of Councillor Brett celebrating 70 years of the National Health Service.

Councillor Rye declared a non-pecuniary interest in Item 7 Opposition Business as he was connected to the owner of a small business which would be affected by the proposals.

7

OPPOSITION PRIORITY BUSINESS - "THE EXPANSION OF THE ULTRA LOW EMISSION ZONE TO THE NORTH AND SOUTH CIRCULARS"

Councillor Laban introduced the issues paper, prepared by the Opposition Group.

1. Issues highlighted by Councillor Laban were as follows:
 - Whilst supporting the introduction of the Ultra-Low Admission Zone (ULEZ), as originally proposed by Boris Johnson, when Mayor of London, to improve London's air quality, she could not support the current Mayor, Sadiq Khan's, proposal to extend the zone beyond the Central London Congestion Zone to the North and South Circular Roads.

COUNCIL - 19.7.2018

- She felt that the consequences of expansion had not been fully debated and the extension would have a detrimental impact on small businesses and local people living on the boundaries. People with vehicles that were not ULEZ compliant will be charged £12.50 to enter the zone. She felt that this would have a disproportionate effect on small businesses and people on low incomes who could not afford to upgrade their vehicles.
 - Residents living the Central London Congestion Zone had been allowed a sunset clause allowing them time to make the changes but this had not been extended to those living within the M25.
 - People visiting North Middlesex Hospital and local schools would have to pay the charge, every time they entered the zone, dividing communities.
 - The impact on small businesses could cause them to become financially unviable which could result in the closure of businesses and the loss of jobs. Local businesses were she thought the lifeblood of the community.
 - The North Circular itself was not in the zone which would mean that vehicles which were not compliant would be more likely to use it, adding to the pollution in the area.
 - Many other outer London boroughs were concerned about the impact and felt that the zone could increase congestion and pollution in surrounding roads.
 - It was not fair in her opinion that those in central London should be offered a sunset clause, whilst those in Enfield would have to pay on as soon as the zone was introduced.
2. Councillor Nesil Caliskan, Leader of the Council, responded on behalf of the Majority Group highlighting:
- Air pollution in London was consistently breaching legal limits. In recent times the Government had lost several challenges through failing to do something about harmful nitrogen oxide emissions.
 - Public health advice was that improving air quality would improve health. Most recent reports show that each car costs the NHS £8,000 due to the effects of air pollution. She felt that a look needed to be taken at the long term savings that can be achieved by improving health and also reducing the number of deaths due to pollution. Air pollution can cause lung cancer, cardiovascular diseases and dementia. Air quality in many schools breaches legal limits. In Enfield 350 deaths can be linked to poor air. This disproportionately affects children and people living in poorer communities.
 - The introduction of the ULEZ would reduce air pollution and improve health outcomes. It would be an even greater improvement if the zone was extended to the M25 and she felt that the Opposition should support the administration in lobbying for this. The administration supported the increased priority and profile that the Mayor has given to tackling air pollution but also agreed with the London Council position

COUNCIL - 19.7.2018

that the current proposals were not ideal as they could divide communities..

- There was no evidence for the claim that the zone would increase traffic on the North Circular and local roads and add to pollution. Even so she did recognise this could be a potential risk but was aware that the Mayor of London was committed to review the policy and closely monitor any impact.
- The Leader wanted the Council to be able to provide support for low income families and small businesses to upgrade their vehicles, had asked officers to research how to do this and to work with Transport for London to provide more rapid electrical charging points and improve local public transport. She felt that the Opposition would have more credibility if they were to join with the administration to lobby the Government to bring in a diesel vehicle scrappage scheme which she thought would show a more convincing concern for improving air quality for poorer residents of the borough.
- The Opposition should also support the Labour administration in bringing forward options to help mitigate the impact for people visiting North Middlesex Hospital. There was time enough to adjust the scheme before it was implemented in 2021.

3. Other issues highlighted during the debate were as follows:

a. The need highlighted by the members of the Opposition Group:

- To acknowledge that the charges would have the most impact on people on low incomes and with health problems which was felt to be unfair.
- Whilst acknowledging the urgent need to tackle emissions, implementing the ULEZ was not felt to be the best way to improve air quality. An integrated industrial strategy was needed with a plan to reduce nitrogen dioxide emissions.
- To recognise that the Government had already agreed to phase out diesel cars by 2040, had set aside £36 billion to improve air quality, was looking at promoting the move from petrol to electric vehicles and improving the electrical charging point infrastructure.
- To accept that the Opposition was supportive of a diesel vehicle scrappage scheme
- To recognise the need to update the Council's Air Quality Plan which was focussed reducing car use and increasing cycling and walking. However there were concerns that not enough people were using the cycle lanes.
- To accept the view that the Mayor should be looking to retrofit all public transport to use cleaner fuels.

COUNCIL - 19.7.2018

- To recognise that not including the North and South Circulars in the scheme would make pollution in those areas worse.
- To acknowledge that charging vehicles to enter the zone was just a money making scheme.
- To recognise that the scheme would not have the intended affect and would increase pollution, increase rat running and that parents walking their children to school in the area would in fact be subject to more pollution.
- Many people were unaware of the scheme and there was a need to ensure that they were made aware.
- Concern about the loss of electric charging points in the Genotin Road Car Park.

b. The need highlighted by members of the Majority Group:

- To acknowledge that bad air was killing residents and was responsible for 350 premature deaths in Enfield. The health arguments in support of the scheme were thought to be indisputable.
- To support the Mayor in his efforts to improve air quality and to campaign with the majority group to bring forward the implementation date, extend the zone to the M25, to encourage people to move to cleaner vehicles and use more sustainable means of transport, such as cycling and walking.
- That the scheme would reduce pollution by at least 4% and up to 27% in some areas.
- To acknowledge that Enfield had lost £700m worth of grants from Central Government.
- The need to reduce over reliance on the car, to make people aware that people were exposed to more pollution when travelling by car, that the population was increasing and it was essential that we encourage more people to walk and cycle. Even electric cars still required polluting power.
- The Government had dragged its feet for 3 years on air quality, despite challenges from the European Union, any change would be too late for those who have died from conditions exacerbated by poor air. The cost to the NHS was billions.

COUNCIL - 19.7.2018

- If we leave the European Union it was important to ensure that we stick to the same high standards of the rest of Europe.

During the debate Councillor Erbil moved and Councillor Anderson seconded a proposal under para 9.2 to increase the time allowed for Opposition Business by 15 minutes. This was agreed without a vote.

4. At the end of the debate Councillor Laban summed up on behalf of the Opposition Group as follows:

She did not agree with the ULEZ proposals and would, with her shadow cabinet colleagues, write to the Mayor to ask him to reconsider the proposals in the light of the impact on people visiting the North Middlesex Hospital. She was also concerned that people skirting round the ULEZ boundaries would increase pollution in those areas. She felt that people ought to be made aware of what the impact of the scheme would be on small businesses and people on low incomes in Enfield. She felt that a sunset clause was necessary and that to charge people £12.50 to go to hospital was barbaric.

5. Councillor Caliskan, Leader of the Council, then summed up on behalf of the majority group responding to the recommendations in the Opposition Priority Business Paper as follows:

- That the electric charging points currently situated in the Genotin Road Car Park would be moved to another location.
- She could not support recommendation 2.1, because she was not opposed to the expansion of the scheme, but rather thought the zone should be extended to cover the M25. The Labour Council had put on record that they welcomed the initiative to clean up the air and called on the Opposition to join the administration in urging the Mayor of London to extend the ULEZ to the M25.
- She was happy to agree to recommendation 2.2 for the Cabinet Member for Health and Social Care and the Shadow Cabinet Member for Health and Social Care to meet with the Chief Executive of North Middlesex Hospital to discuss potential mitigation measures so that residents whose cars were non-compliant would not be charged £12.50 to access health care. Cabinet members and senior officers already meet regularly with the North Middlesex Chief Executive and they would continue to work with all stakeholders to find a solution for the issue.
- In relation to recommendation 2.3 she was happy for the Council to work with Transport for London in delivering their stakeholder engagement plan to highlight the ULEZ policy. Transport for London have already undertaken a Londonwide consultation and

COUNCIL - 19.7.2018

will be undertaking significant publicity campaigns ahead of each phase.

- In relation to recommendation 2.4 she felt that it would be disastrous to reverse the Mayor's decision as this would have a severe impact on the health of many Enfield residents and therefore could not be acceptable. Rather than a sunset clause, she felt that the Opposition should support the administration in lobbying the government for targeted assistance to vehicle owners (a scrappage scheme).
- She understood in relation to recommendation 2.5 that SourceLondon could not provide the necessary technology to introduce more rapid charging points as they only do slow recharging parts and that more research was required on this issue. The Council was already working with Transport for London to identify new sites and deliver new electric vehicle rapid charging points.

There was no vote on the Leader's response.

8

CHANGE IN THE ORDER OF BUSINESS

Councillor Ergin Erbil moved and Councillor Anderson seconded a proposal under paragraph 2.2(B) of the Council procedure rules to change the order of items on the agenda to take the following motions in the following order:

- 11.2 Motion in the name of Councillor Brett
- 11.3 Motion in the name of Councillor Taylor
- 11.1 Motion in the name of Councillor Barry
- 11.6 Motion in the name of Councillor Caliskan

The change in the order was agreed after a vote with the following result:

For: 37
Against: 14
Abstentions: 0

The minutes reflect the order of the meeting.

9

MOTIONS

Motion 11.2

Councillor Brett moved and Councillor Hamilton seconded the following motion.

COUNCIL - 19.7.2018

“The NHS has turned 70 on July 5th. This internationally admired British institution, the world’s first, universally public funded health care system delivering on the basis of clinical need, and not the ability to pay, employs over a million dedicated staff. It is in crisis though, following eight years of effectively frozen budgets, and reforms that have sought to undermine the integrity of the NHS. Staff deliver day in day out under the threat of repeated reorganisations.

The government has promised the cash starved NHS an extra 20 billion by 2023, with only 4 billion available immediately rather than the immediate 7.7billion it needs. This is disastrous and is no birthday present.

We call on the Council to write to the government to honour the NHS and its staff properly by appointing July 5th a Bank Holiday and by providing the funding it needs now.”

Following the debate the motion was put to the vote and agreed with the following result:

For: 37
Against: 15
Abstentions: 0

Motion 11.3

Councillor Taylor moved and Councillor Brett seconded the following motion:

“Enfield Council notes the report of the National Audit Office on Universal Credit and calls for an immediate halt to the roll out and a fundamental reappraisal of the system.”

Duration of the time allowed for Motions

In the middle of the debate the Mayor advised that the time allocated for motions had now elapsed. Councillor Ergin Erbil moved and Councillor Anderson seconded a proposal to extend the time available for another 15 minutes. The procedural motion was put to the vote and agreed with the following result:

For: 34
Against: 14
Abstentions: 0

Following the debate, the motion was put to the vote and agreed with the following result:

For: 36
Against: 14
Abstentions: 0

Duration of the time allowed for motions.

The Mayor advised, at this stage of the meeting, that the time available for motions had now elapsed so Council Procedure Rule 9 would apply.

Motions 11.1, 11.4, 11.5, and 11.6 lapsed under the guillotine.

10

DURATION OF TIME ALLOWED FOR THE COUNCIL MEETING

The Mayor advised, at this stage of the meeting, that the time available to complete the agenda had now elapsed so Council Procedure Rule 9 would apply. No further contributions or replies were permitted.

NOTED that in accordance with Council Procedure Rule 9 (page 4-8 – Part 4), the remaining items of business on the Council agenda were considered without debate.

11

REFERENCES FROM MEMBER AND DEMOCRATIC SERVICES GROUP

10.1 The Council received a report from the Executive Director of People's Services recommending changes to the Health and Wellbeing Board Terms of Reference. (Report No: 45)

NOTED

1. Changes to the terms of reference were considered by the Member and Democratic Services Group on 21 June 2018 and recommended for Council approval.
2. Following consideration at the Member and Democratic Services Group a further change had been put forward for Council approval: that the board membership should include a representative from Enfield Voluntary Action, in recognition that this is the largest umbrella voluntary group in Enfield.

AGREED the changes to the Health and Wellbeing Board Terms of Reference as set out the appendix to the report with the addition of the proposed change to the board membership noted above.

10.2 The Council received a report from the Executive Director of People's Services recommending changes to the Member Governor Forum terms of reference. (Report No: 46)

NOTED

1. Changes to the terms of reference were considered by the Member and Democratic Services Group on 21 June 2018 and recommended for Council approval.

2. The revised terms of reference as set out in the appendix attached to the update sheet tabled at the Council meeting, replacing the appendix published with the agenda.

AGREED the changes to the Member Governor Terms of Reference as set out in the revised appendix to the report.

It was noted that the Opposition would have voted against the changes to the Member Governor Terms of Reference, if there had been time for a vote.

12

COUNCILLOR CONDUCT COMMITTEE ANNUAL REPORT 2017/8

The Council received the Annual Report of the Councillor Conduct Committee 2017/18 setting out the work of the committee over the past year.

NOTED

1. That the report was approved and recommended onto Council by the Councillor Conduct Committee on 11 July 2018.

AGREED to note the report.

13

AUDIT AND RISK MANAGEMENT COMMITTEE ANNUAL REPORT 2017/18

Council received the annual report of the Audit and Risk Management Committee 2017/18, covering the key issues dealt with by the Committee over the past year.

NOTED

1. That the report was approved for referral onto Council by the Audit and Risk Management Committee at a meeting held on 20 June 2018.

AGREED to note the report.

14

COUNCILLOR QUESTION TIME

1. Urgent Questions

There were no urgent questions.

2. Questions by Councillors

NOTED the thirty two questions on the Council agenda and the written responses provided by the relevant Cabinet Members and Chair of the Licensing Sub Committee.

**15
COMMITTEE MEMBERSHIP**

AGREED to confirm the following changes to committee memberships:

- Audit and Risk Management Committee – Councillor Hass Yusuf to replace Councillor Gina Needs

To note that Councillor Aramaz had been appointed as a Vice Chair of the Licensing Committee.

**16
NOMINATIONS TO OUTSIDE BODIES**

AGREED to confirm the following changes to the nominations for Outside Bodies.

- London Borough of Enfield/Enfield Racial Equality Council (LBE/EREC) Councillor Greer to replace Councillor Barry
- Citizen's Advice Bureau – to appoint Councillor Rick Jewell as the Council's representative.
- Safer Stronger Communities Board – Councillor Keazor to replace Councillors Aydin and Uddin.
- Enfield, Essex and Hertfordshire Border Liaison Group – Broxbourne, Epping Forest, Lee Valley RPA, Enfield, Essex and Herts – Councillors Dogan, Oykenor and Hasan to replace Councillors Gunawardena, Demirel and Orhan.

**17
CALLED IN DECISIONS**

None received.

**18
DATE OF NEXT MEETING**

NOTED that the next meeting of the Council will take place on Thursday 20 September 2018 at 7pm.

The Mayor thanked everyone for attending the meeting. All sent their best wishes for a speedy recovery to Councillor Tolga Aramaz who had been involved in an accident on the previous evening.

